

# Item 3.1 - Minutes

## Development Management Sub-Committee of the Planning Committee

10.00am, Wednesday 9 January 2019

### Present:

Councillors Gardiner (Convener), Child (Vice-Convener), Councillor Booth, Dixon, Gordon, Griffiths, McLellan, Mitchell, Mowat, Neil Ross (substituting for Councillor Osler) and Staniforth.

### 1. General Applications and Miscellaneous Business

---

The Sub-Committee considered reports on planning applications listed in Sections 4, and 7 of the agenda for the meeting.

#### Requests for Presentations

The Chief Planning Officer gave a presentation on agenda Item 4.3 – 30 Canann Lane, Edinburgh (At Land to Rear Of) requested by Councillor Neil Ross.

The Chief Planning Officer gave a presentation on agenda Item 4.4 – 40 Craigleith Hill Avenue, Edinburgh requested by Councillor Osler.

The Chief Planning Officer gave a presentation on agenda Item 4.7 – 2-3 Montgomery Street Lane, Edinburgh requested by Councillors Booth and Staniforth.

The Chief Planning Officer gave a presentation on Item 4.8 – 5 Warriston Road, Edinburgh requested by Councillor Booth.

#### Decision

To determine the applications as detailed in the Appendix to this minute.

(Reference – reports by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

### 2. Corstorphine Hospital, 136 Corstorphine Road Edinburgh

---

The Chief Planning Officer had identified an application for planning permission for the redevelopment of the former Corstorphine Hospital to form 76 residential apartments (including 44 new build apartments) and associated community hub, vehicular access, car parking and landscape works (as amended) – (application no 17/04137/FUL) to be dealt with by means of a hearing.

#### (a) Report by the Chief Planning Officer

The proposal was for a change of use and redevelopment of the former hospital site for residential use that comprised a total of 76 apartments that included 30 apartments in the original hospital building (11 one-bedroom, 12 two-bedroom, 8 three-bedroom and 1

four-bedroom); 24 apartments in two new rear extensions to the main hospital building (8 one-bedroom, 12 two-bedroom and 2 three-bedroom); and 22 apartments in a new building to the south of the main hospital building (13 two-bedroom and 9 three-bedroom). It was proposed that the South Lodge would be converted to a community hub and management/concierge services centre.

The site lay within an urban area in the Edinburgh Local Development Plan (LDP). Policy Hou 1 stated that housing development would be supported on suitable sites in the urban area, provided the proposals were compatible with other policies in the plan. Policy Hou 5 supported the conversion of non-residential buildings to housing in the area, provided a satisfactory residential environment could be achieved with appropriate open space. Provided other policy requirements were met, the development was acceptable in principle.

LDP Policy 4 permitted proposals to alter or extend a listed building where the alterations or extensions were justified. There would be no unnecessary damage to the building's historic structure or diminution of its interest and any additions were in keeping with other parts of the building. The other structures to be demolished comprised the boiler houses and laundry to the rear of the main hospital building and North Lodge were of no special historic or architectural merit and the cleared land would be used for soft landscaping.

The other proposed alterations to the original hospital building were restrained and appropriate, and respected the original fenestration pattern, window surrounds and door openings. The relocation of the gateposts, dwarf wall and railings on the east side of the main entrance on the same alignment further east would have no adverse impact on the basic design of the entrance. The proposed alterations and extensions were therefore justified and would cause no unnecessary damage to the building's historic structure or diminution of its interest, in compliance with LDP Policy Env 4.

There were no potential amenity impacts on future residents because the proposed residential development was in a predominantly residential area and Environmental Protection had no objections to the proposed development, subject to conditions. The development complied with the daylighting, overshadowing and privacy standards in the Edinburgh Design Guidance. There were no neighboring residential properties in close proximity to the site.

The Roads Authority had recommended refusal of the application on the basis that the proposed changes to the existing access did not promote inclusive mobility and prioritised walking and cycling ahead of other transport modes. The scheme had been revised to propose a 125mm upstand kerb to ensure that pedestrian safety was not compromised and a section of the access road at the main entrance where the gradient was less steep had been designed to adoptable standards. An informative had been added regarding speed reduction and traffic management measures to reduce vehicle speed on the access road.

Proposed parking provision breached the Council's 2017 parking standards which allowed for a maximum of 76 parking spaces in Zone 2. However, the application was submitted prior to the approval of the 2017 parking standards, hence the Council's 2009 parking standards had been used in assessing the application. The proposed 102 car parking spaces, which included 7 accessible spaces, 15 visitor spaces and 4 electric vehicle charging spaces, complied with the 2009 parking standards which required a total minimum of 91 parking in this zone (formerly Zone 3a).

Flood Planning and the Scottish Environmental Protection Agency had raised no objection to the final scheme in terms of increased or integral flood risk. Edinburgh Airport had no objections on the grounds of aerodrome safety, provided that conditions regarding bird hazard and a Sustainable Urban Drainage Scheme were applied and appropriate conditions had been applied.

The north and east boundaries of the site were in close proximity to several animal enclosures within Edinburgh Zoo, including those of the Giant Pandas and the Monkey House. The pandas were particularly vulnerable in terms of negative health impacts to noise and vibration during demolition and construction works and Edinburgh Zoo had raised concerns for the pandas' well-being.

For this reason, Scottish Ministers had issued a direction requiring the Council to notify Ministers if it intended to approve the application, given that concerns around the welfare of the pandas could raise issues of national importance.

A condition had been attached based on an agreement reached between the applicant and Zoo which gave comfort that the redevelopment would not progress before adequate measures were taken to ensure that the wellbeing of the pandas was safeguarded from the possible negative impacts of demolition and construction works. These measures would also cover any possible negative impacts on the health of other animals in close proximity to the development.

Also, the construction of two new panda houses in the north-east section of the zoo was underway, so the animals could be re-located away from the development site. The objections submitted by Edinburgh Zoo and an individual had been withdrawn.

Overall, the proposals complied with the Local Development Plan and non-statutory guidance, with the exception of Policy Tra 2 in terms of car parking provision, but a departure was justified in this instance. The proposals had no adverse effect on the character or setting of the listed building and were acceptable in terms of scale, form, design and materials. The development would have no detrimental impact on significant archeological remains, residential amenity, road safety or infrastructure and would have no significant impacts in terms of flooding or aerodrome safety.

The Chief Planning Officer considered that there were no other material considerations which outweighed this conclusion and therefore it was recommended that the Sub-Committee grant planning permission and listed building consent.

The presentation can be viewed via the link below:

[https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast\\_interactive/372407](https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/372407)

**(b) Applicant and Applicant's Agent**

John Campbell (James Walker Leith Limited, holding company of the Applicant), Jeremy Scott (Michael Laird Architects), Iain MacPhail (Affordable Housing Consultant) and Alex Sneddon (Transport Planning Limited) were heard in support of the application.

Mr Campbell advised that the main focus was to ensure that the C listed building was preserved, enhanced and brought back into use. The setting would also be improved. This has been a long and complicated application process.

Edinburgh Zoo had been of significant consideration throughout the application process. A legally binding cooperation agreement had been entered into with Scottish Ministers and the Royal Zoological Society of Scotland, and strict management controls had been implemented on construction activities which included working within agreed of acoustical and vibration criteria to ensure the protection and well-being of all the animals in the zoo. The applicant and Scottish Ministers had facilitated the building of two new panda houses for the zoo which should bring significant benefits for the zoo and the city.

Mr Scott provided further information on the architectural concept of the proposals. Externally, the listed building was in quite good condition, apart from the additions that had been made by the NHS over the years due to the requirements of the hospital. Internally, the intention was to restore the building back to its original state. An underground car park was proposed so that visually there would be no parked cars to clutter the landscape.

In terms of affordable housing, Mr MacPhail advised that the applicant's intention from the outset was not to look for a commuted sum but to have affordable housing on site. Engagement had taken place with Link Housing Association and LAR Housing Trust in October 2017, and from the beginning of the process the applicant had worked with the Council's housing department. It was identified by the Housing Associations that there would be a £3.23m shortfall to build affordable housing on site. This equated to a £170,000 shortfall per unit for 19 homes, even if a maximum subsidy had been identified. The Housing Associations advised that the abnormal cost made it difficult to build affordable housing on site due to the topography, ground conditions and conservation area requirements. Second opinions were provided from other Housing Associations advising it would be beyond their financial reach to build affordable housing onsite. The Council accepted that a commuted sum was the route forward. The Council asked the district valuer to carry out an independent assessment of the commuted sum value which would be secured by a Section 75 agreement.

The presentation can viewed via the link below:

[https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast\\_interactive/372407](https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/372407)

## **Decision**

### **Motion**

To grant planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Chief Planning Officer, and:

- 1) An additional condition that a revised landscaping scheme, which addressed access issues for disabled users on the site was brought back to the Development Management Sub-Committee for consideration.
- 2) A further condition that the pandas were moved to their new enclosure prior to the commencement of building works on site.

- moved by Councillor Gardiner, seconded by Councillor Gordon.

### **Amendment**

To refuse planning permission as the application was contrary to LDP Policies Tra 2, Tra 3 and Hou 6.

- moved by Councillor Booth, seconded by Councillor Staniforth.

### **Voting**

For the motion: - 9 votes

(Councillors Child, Dixon, Gardiner, Gordon, Griffiths, McLellan, Mitchell, Mowat and Osler and Neil Ross)

For the amendment: - 2 votes

(Councillors Booth and Staniforth)

### **Decision**

To grant planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Chief Planning Officer, and:

- 1) An additional condition that a revised landscaping scheme, which addressed access issues for disabled users on the site was brought back to the Development Management Sub-Committee for consideration.
- 2) A further condition that the pandas were moved to their new enclosure prior to the commencement of building works on site.

(Reference – report by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

## **3. Corstorphine Hospital, 136 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh**

---

The Chief Planning Officer had identified an application for listed building consent for the redevelopment of the former Corstorphine Hospital building to form 54 residential apartments (application no 17/04138/LBC) to be dealt with by means of a hearing.

### **Decision**

To grant listed building consent subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives set out in Section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.

(Reference – report by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

#### 4. 30 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh

---

Details were provided of applications for planning permission and listed building consent for the conversion of the former nursing home, gate lodge and stable block to residential use, erection of two residential blocks comprising 27 residential units, associated landscaping and ancillary works – application nos 17/05071/FUL and 17/05073/LBC.

The Chief Planning Officer gave details of the proposals and the planning considerations involved and recommended that the applications for planning permission and listed building consent be granted.

##### **Motion**

To continue the application for a hearing.

- moved by Councillor Gardiner seconded by Councillor Staniforth.

##### **Amendment**

To determine the application today.

- moved by Councillor Dixon, seconded by Councillor Booth.

##### **Voting**

For the motion: - 6 votes

(Councillors Gardiner, Gordon, McLellan, Mitchell, Mowat and Staniforth)

For the amendment: - 5 votes

(Councillors Booth, Child, Dixon, Griffiths and Neil Ross)

##### **Decision**

To continue the application for a hearing.

(Reference – report by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

#### 5. Springwell House, 1 Gorgie Road

---

Details were provided of a planning application for a change of use and conversion of the original Springwell House buildings from vacant offices to 39 new residential apartments, demolition of some rear extensions and construction of 7 new houses, refurbishment of existing lodge house and construction of new detached lodge house giving 48 residential units in total (as amended) – application no 18/00892/FUL.

The Chief Planning Officer gave details of the proposals and the planning considerations involved and recommended that the application be granted.

##### **Motion**

To grant planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives and a legal agreement detailed in the report by the Chief Planning Officer.

- moved by Councillor Child, seconded by Councillor Mowat.

## **Amendment**

To refuse planning permission as the application was contrary to LDP Policies Hou 3 and Hou 6.

- moved by Councillor Gardiner, seconded by Councillor Booth.

## **Voting**

For the motion: - 6 votes

(Councillors Child, Griffiths, McLellan, Mitchell, Mowat and Neil Ross)

For the amendment: - 5 votes

(Councillors Booth, Dixon, Gardiner, Gordon, and Staniforth)

## **Decision**

To grant planning permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives and a legal agreement as detailed in the report by the Chief Planning Officer.

(Reference – report by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

## **6. 2-3 Montgomery Street, Edinburgh**

---

Details were provided of a planning application for a change of use from two existing lock ups and a meditation/yoga centre to form annex hotel accommodation to 10 -18 Windsor St. The accommodation would comprise a one bed and a two bed unit both with self-catering facilities – application no 18/09103/FUL.

## **Motion**

To grant planning permission subject to the informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer

- moved by Councillor Gardiner, seconded by Councillor Child.

## **Amendment**

To refuse planning permission as the planning application was contrary to Local Development Plan (LDP) Policy Hou 7.

- moved by Booth, seconded by Councillor Staniforth.

## **Voting**

For the motion: - 9 votes

(Councillors Child, Dixon, Gardiner, Griffiths, McLellan, Mitchell, Mowat, and Ross)

For the amendment: - 2 votes

(Councillors Booth and Staniforth)

## **Decision**

To grant planning permission subject to the informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.

(Reference – report by the Chief Planning Officer, submitted.)

## Appendix

Agenda Item No. / Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<p>Note: Detailed conditions/reasons for the following decisions are contained in the statutory planning register.</p>		
<p><a href="#"><u>Item 4.1 - The Jewel (At Land East of Corbieshot)</u></a></p>	<p>The Jewel (At Land East of Corbieshot) - Forthcoming application by Robertson Living for application for residential development, associated access, roads, landscaping and infrastructure works - application no 18/10006/PAN</p>	<p>To note the key issues at this stage.</p>
<p><a href="#"><u>Item 4.2 - 20A Inverleith Row, Edinburgh (At Royal Botanic Garden)</u></a></p>	<p>20A Inverleith Row, Edinburgh (At Royal Botanic Garden) – Forthcoming application by Royal Botanic Garden for redevelopment and refurbishment of the North East corner of the Royal Botanic Garden. Development comprises works to listed buildings/structures. Construction of a glasshouse, research glasshouses, education and support buildings and landscape works. Erection of 6 polytunnels/temporary decent facilities, construction of access road and associated development and demolition – application no 18/09704/PAN</p>	<p>To note the key issues at this stage.</p>
<p><a href="#"><u>Item 4.3 - 30 Canaan Lane, Edinburgh (At Land To Rear Of)</u></a></p>	<p>30 Canaan Lane, Edinburgh (At Land To Rear Of) – New dwelling house and driveway accessed from Jordan Lane (as amended) – application no 18/04505/FUL</p>	<p>To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer and an additional condition that the existing opening was blocked off with stone existing rendered brick pillars were removed and filled in with stone.</p>

Agenda Item No. / Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<a href="#"><u>Item 4.4 - 140 Craigleith Hill Avenue, Edinburgh</u></a>	40 Craigleith Hill Avenue, Edinburgh EH4 2JN – Proposed single storey rear extension with access to garden (in retrospect) – application no 18/08460/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.
<a href="#"><u>Item 4.5 - 6 Derby Street, Edinburgh EH6 4SH</u></a>	6 Derby Street, Edinburgh EH6 4SH – Convert existing attic with dormer to front and rooflights. Internal alternations with rear extension (as amended) – application no 18/08318/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.
<a href="#"><u>Item 4.6 - Kellerstain Stables, Gogar Station Road, Edinburgh</u></a>	Kellerstain Stables, Gogar Station Road, Edinburgh – Erection of new one-and-a-half storey dwelling house on Land to the North East of Kellerstain Estate on Land 40 Metres South Of Kellerstain Lodge, Gogar Station Road, Edinburgh - application no 18/07199/PPP	To <b>REFUSE</b> Planning Permission for the reason set out in the report by the Chief Planning Officer.
<a href="#"><u>Item 4.7 - 2 – 3 Montgomery Street Lane, Edinburgh EH7 5JT</u></a>	2 – 3 Montgomery Street Lane, Edinburgh EH7 5JT – Change of use from two existing lock ups and a meditation/yoga centre to form annex hotel accommodation to 10 -18 Windsor St. The accommodation will comprise a one bed and a two bed unit both with self-catering facilities – application no 18/09103/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.  (on a division).
<a href="#"><u>Item 4.8 - 5 Warriston Road, Edinburgh, EH3 5LQ</u></a>	Development of 11 new residential flats including associated parking, infrastructure and landscaping (as amended) – application no 18/02451/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives, a legal agreement and referral to Scottish Ministers as set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.

Agenda Item No. / Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<a href="#">Item 5.1 - 4 Mayfield Gardens, Edinburgh, EH9 2BU</a>	4 Mayfield Gardens, Edinburgh, EH9 2BU – Proposed change of use from a 7 bedroom guesthouse with ancillary private living quarters to a 13 bed 15 person HMO with associated works (as amended) – application no 18/07251/FUL –	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.
<a href="#">6.1 (a) Corstorphine Hospital, 136 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh</a>	Corstorphine Hospital, 136 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh – Redevelopment of the former Corstorphine Hospital to form 76 residential apartments (including 44 new build apartments) and associated community hub, vehicular access, car parking and landscape works (as amended) – application no 17/04137/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer, and a legal agreement, and: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) An additional condition that a revised landscaping scheme, which addressed access issues for disabled users on the site, was brought back to Committee for consideration.</li> <li>2) A further condition that the pandas were moved to their new enclosure prior to the commencement of building works on site.</li> </ol> (on a division).
<a href="#">6.1 (b) Corstorphine Hospital, 136 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh</a>	Corstorphine Hospital, 136 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh – Redevelopment of the former Corstorphine Hospital building to form 54 residential apartments - application no 17/04138/LBC	To <b>GRANT</b> Listed Building Consent subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.
<a href="#">Item 7.1(a) - 30 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh, EH12 6HP, Edinburgh</a>	Conversion of the former nursing home, gate lodge and stable block to residential use, erection of two residential blocks comprising 27 residential units, associated landscaping and ancillary works – application no 17/05071/FUL	To <b>CONTINUE</b> the application for a hearing.  (on a division).

Agenda Item No. / Address	Details of Proposal/Reference No	Decision
<a href="#"><u>Item 7.1(b) - 30 Corstorphine Road, Edinburgh, EH12 6HP</u></a>	Alterations to stable block and removal of non-original extensions to former Tor Nursing Home. Alterations to Torwood House to facilitate conversion to residential use (as amended) – application no 17/05073/LBC	To <b>CONTINUE</b> the application for a hearing. (on a division).
<a href="#"><u>Item 7.2 - Springwell House, 1 Gorgie Road, Edinburgh EH12 6HP</u></a>	Springwell House, 1 Gorgie Road, Edinburgh - Change of use and conversion of the original Springwell House buildings from vacant offices to 39 new residential apartments. Demolition of some rear extensions and construction of 7 new town houses. Refurbishment of existing lodge house and construction of new detached lodge house giving 48 residential units in total (as amended) –application no 18/00892/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the conditions, reasons, and informatives and a legal agreement as set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer. (on a division). Note: To agree that a briefing note would be circulated to elected members on how Economic Viability Assessments were carried out.
<a href="#"><u>8.1 (a) 20 Charlotte Square, Edinburgh</u></a>	Alteration and extension to offices, removal of non-original dormers to front elevation (as amended) – application no 18/03695/FUL	To <b>GRANT</b> Planning Permission subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives and a legal agreement as set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer, and to amend condition 2 to request that a revised planting scheme was considered for the living wall that would allow increased pollination.
<a href="#"><u>8.2 (b) 20, 21 and 22-23 Charlotte Square, Edinburgh</u></a>	Demolition of existing non-original rear extensions and dormers to front elevation, construction of new rear extensions and new mansard roof at rear, installation of new rooflights, slim double glazed windows and internal alterations (as amended) – application no 18/03413/LBC	To <b>GRANT</b> Listed Building Consent subject to the conditions, reasons and informatives set out in section 3 of the report by the Chief Planning Officer.